

NIZHÓNÍGO NA'ACH'AAH BAHANE'

20th Century and Contemporary Native Art

Nizhónígo Na'ach'aah bahane'
Comparing and Contrasting the Art and Literature of Two Diné artists

Tiffany L. Tracy

Diné Institute for Navajo Nation Educators (DINÉ)

2019

Author Note:

Tiffany L. Tracy, DINÉ Institute Fellow, is a 2nd grade teacher at Ganado Primary School within the Ganado Unified School District which is located in Ganado, Arizona on the Diné Nation.

Acknowledgements must be given to the teachers from all over the Diné Institute who supported one another with sharing of cultural and topical knowledge. To Dr. Jennifer McLerran for providing rich knowledge about Contemporary Native American Art and uninterrupted ally-ship to Native Arts and artisans. To Dr. Angelina Castagno for devoting time to get the Institute off the ground. To Jolene Smith for including me on her journey of growth as an educator and continuing the work of the late Marilyn Dempsey. Lastly to my students, the community, my family, and to our elders and ancestors who made our presence possible with the power of their prayers.

Correspondence in regard to this curriculum unit can be addressed to Tiffany L. Tracy, P.O. Box 2851, Fort Defiance, AZ, 86504. Email contact: dineteachersinstitute@nau.edu.

NIZHÓNÍGO NA'ACH'AAH BAHANE'

Tiffany Tracy

Nizhónígo Na'ach'aah bahane': Comparing and Contrasting the Art and Literature of Two Diné Artists

Tiffany Tracy

Introduction

This is my second unit for the Diné Institute for Navajo Nation Educators, and my third unit overall through the Yale National Initiative's model of curricular development for students in diverse classrooms. The unit I created last year was based on the topic of the corn field, and the corn that was harvested this year took on many qualities similar to those of the students who planted them. I can see the growth is stronger in the ones who I carefully instructed and delicately spoke to compared to the ones who were rushed. I can see a difference between the seeds that were planted by kids who were barely coming out of their shell and had to develop their self-esteem throughout the school year, and the seeds planted by those who had cultural knowledge through strong family support. It shows in the corn. The more attention I gave to the plants the better they grew, and when I saw those same kids this year as third graders, I was so excited to see them and I am happy to say they were excited to see me and ask about how the plants were growing.

As Diné, it is a part of our foundational philosophical thought that our children are seeds, and they will thrive with care and attention because they are both sacred, cherished beings. The soil here in Ganado is clay, we have barely received any rain, and there are bullheads all over, but the corn made it to full development and was able to be harvested. I felt so much connection with my kids from last year through the unit we completed together that I knew I had to yield something from what we planted because the students worked so hard and I worked so hard to maintain the growth. I felt nothing but reward and love from my children and the activities we completed through the unit from last year entitled, "Alchini bida'akeh: Teachings from the Corn Field." I have faith in what we are collectively doing as teachers in this institute because I know we can make learning culturally engaging and rewarding for our kids and for ourselves and I hope that this new unit will produce a similar outcome.

Context and Rationale

Classroom Demographic

Ganado Primary School is within the Ganado Unified School District in Ganado, Arizona which is on the Diné Nation. Ganado Unified School District (GUSD) serves not only the Ganado community, but serves students from 13 surrounding communities. Our district serves, the neighboring communities of Fort Defiance, St. Michaels, Kinlichee, Nazlini, Cornfields, Greasewood, Klagetoh, Wide Ruins, Sanders, Steamboat, Jeddito, and Whitecone. The longest distance a bus has to travel is 43 miles one way. According to a 2010 Navajo Nation Population Profile by the 2010 Census, Ganado has a population of 2,504, which includes Navajo and other ethnicities living in the community (Navajo Division of Health, 2013). According to the school's impact aid information, the total population of students who were enrolled for the 2018-2019

NIZHÓNÍGO NA'ACH'AAH BAHANE'

school year was 1,544. The following numbers represent students who are enrolled in GUSD who are from the surrounding communities; Cornfields – 118, Ft. Defiance – 18, Ganado – 541, Greasewood – 39, Jeddito – 20, Kinlichee – 245, Klagetoh – 97, Nahatadzil – 9, Nazlini – 74, St. Michaels – 42, Steamboat – 172, White Cone – 8, Wide Ruins – 45.

Ganado Primary's 2nd grade is comprised of four teachers, including myself, all based in the west cluster of our school building. Each class has an average of 20 students, making a total of roughly 80 students for the second-grade class. Based on my personal observations and collaborations with the 2nd grade team, each classroom is comprised of 95% of students who identify as Diné.

The mid-size town nearest in proximity to the Ganado community is Gallup, New Mexico, which is about 60 miles away. The nearest major city is Flagstaff, Arizona, which is a little under 200 miles away. There is a new grocery store in the Ganado community which is called Lowe's, and it is located in Burnside, Arizona, which is four miles northwest of Ganado. There are three convenience stores in the community, two in Burnside, and one in Ganado itself. All three convenience stores have gasoline pumps, and one convenience store has a Burger King.

Reasons for Art and Literacy

The reasons I chose to write a curriculum unit that attempts to touch on literacy through art are, first, I love art and I have a history of always being in the company of beautiful art. Second, I chose to integrate details of literacy because of the low levels of reading fluency and comprehension at the 2nd grade level. In fact, not only is the 2nd grade below reading level expectations, but it extends to the 12th grade as well. Recently, I have received test scores from our district Director of Instructional Services, Dr. Betsy Dobias, that show that from 2nd grade to 12th grade, there are a high number of "at-risk" and "moderate risk" readers. According to Dr. Dobias, the ATI test, also known as Galileo, and the risk summary that was presented at the professional development held on June 15, 2019, measure our standards closely through pre-tests to post-tests, and for the 3rd to 12th grade students the information that was presented does reflect the scores that were received by the district in regard to the AzMERIT test scores. This means that the ATI Galileo test scores serve as an indicator of what scores will be on the AzMERIT assessments.

Influenced by Art- Rationale

As far back as I can remember I have seen art displayed around me. Art was present in my mother's home where I grew up, in my paternal grandmothers' homes, and in the home of my maternal grandparents through their use and gathering of traditional medicines, tools and utilitarian crafts. My mother, who is not a trained artist, has always had an interest in drawing and painting, and creating things. I remember seeing her sketch books with portraits of her friends, relatives, Diana Ross, and Waylon Jennings. I believe I looked at that sketch book until it fell apart. She created an oil painting of Chief Dan George while in college that I love and adore. I've watched her make quilts, clothing, Christmas stockings, Halloween costumes, traditional outfits and birthday invitations. I always admired her creativity and watching and

NIZHÓNÍGO NA'ACH'AAH BAHANE'

seeing her interest in making things and how imaginative she was remains in my thoughts and memories.

My mother's younger brother, whose name is Gibson Gonnie, is an artist who attended art school at the Institute of American Indian Arts. My mother would often tell me how she would drop my uncle off at an old travel center/curio shop along I-40 near Sanders, Arizona called "Fort Courage" where he would catch a bus to his school in Santa Fe, New Mexico. Gibson's art has always been displayed in our home. I loved our living room at our home in Fort Defiance, Arizona because of the art hanging on the walls. Gibson would use wonderful colors that would softly blend together and command your attention to stories of ceremonies and creation.

Gibson had also apprenticed as a medicine person under my *cheii*, the Diné word for maternal grandfather. Gibson followed his father Hosteen Gonnie for many years, learning the stories and the ceremonies that my *cheii* had perfected and was well known for. Gibson mastered the family's ceremonial craft and he would illustrate some of the stories and songs that he learned from his father into pastel, oil, and acrylic. Many of Gibson's paintings featured Diné deities and their roles in Diné moral lessons, or ceremonial processions. I was once told, by whom I don't remember, that only people who had extensive knowledge of the deities were able to draw them, so I felt an even greater sense of respect for the images I would see. My *yáázh* Gibson's work was an extension of the wisdom that my *cheii* possessed and preserved through generations. I can now recognize the feeling I had when observing the paintings; I felt like I was looking into the past, the present and the future. I know this because today I experience the same feeling, but now I can make the relationship and more fully appreciate its significance.

I remember asking my mom what the paintings meant, and she would tell me as best as she could, but it wasn't until recently that I was able to make the connections between the cultural stories I had heard and the images that I had seen on our walls. I could vividly see the representation of the placement of the objects in the paintings translated through a whirlwind of earthy colors, wonderfully showcased on the walls of our living room. Recently I was told of a story about the Navajo basket, and its many tales of creation and trials of the Diné. I experienced the privilege of making a concrete, visualization of what I heard delivered orally through the fusion of colors impressed in my memory. I was able to understand the stories being told so much better, because I could see the image in my mind from a reasonably knowledgeable person's understanding of the topic despite my lack of deeper knowledge.

I had an appreciation of the lines, colors, and shapes involved; but, seeing and hearing the correlation of the story to the image, led to whole new understanding of the painting. The story that was shared with us was about the creation of First Man and First Woman by knowledge holder Lorenzo Max, and it was a version that's not found in books such as Zolbrod's interpretation of the Emergence Story (Zolbrod, 1984). To me, the oral and visual connection I had made really stood out and I feel that it relates to the power that art holds for increasing our understanding of stories. There are ways that a person can interpret words and events through art that another reader wouldn't be able to with just one method of delivery, and to witness a different perspective is vital to comprehension of a subject.

NIZHÓNÍGO NA'ACH'AAH BAHANE'

My maternal grandparents were medicine people. My cheii was a highly respected medicine man and pastoralist in his community of Whitecone, Arizona and my másání (maternal grandmother) gathered medicinal herbs for my cheii to use in ceremony. She also made tools for cooking and puberty rites and she was a weaver. To me, my másání and cheii were artisans of our culture. My cheii made sand paintings, and crafted ceremonial objects used for healing, while my másání carefully planned and spent much time crafting stirring sticks, grass brushes, grinding stones, and weaving tools, as well as shearing sheep, cleaning, carding, and spinning wool for her weaving. My másání made shirts for herself on her pedal-driven Singer sewing machine from the fabric my cheii received through the ceremonies he performed. I would attribute my grandparents' facility with creative processes to the lessons they learned through oral stories and apprenticeship. The knowledge they possessed was no doubt handed down through generations of perfection through storytelling, hands-on application and modeling.

This way of learning, I feel, best fits our students' way of comprehension and is how most Diné were taught. I also feel that there is relevance with being literate through oral transmission of information and stories and not just through printed text. In the article titled, "Reflections on Native American Reading: A Seed, a Tool, and a Weapon," Marlinda White-Kaulaity reflects on the intellect of her parents, who did not attend formal education. White-Kaulaity brings to the surface a reality for many on the reservation and elicits respect and recognition for the many elders of high intellect not derived from Western schooling. Much like the description of my grandparents, White-Kaulaity shares the wisdom of her parents to prove the value of oral literacy.

My parents are highly literate people, but I rarely saw my mother read, and what I saw my father read were newspapers and tribal documents. My parent[s] did not complete formal schooling, but both have given testimonies before U.S. federal courts, speaking eloquently on issues related to Indian land rights, employment rights, and religious freedom. They are masters of oral literacy. (White-Kaulaity, 2007)

My paternal grandmothers' sister, Grace Ryan, was a best friend to famed Navajo artist R.C. Gorman, and all of my grandmothers had beautiful baskets, weavings and paintings on their walls as well. I recall there being an autographed photo of R.C. Gorman in the library area at my grandmother Dorothy's house. My great-grandmother Grace Davis had a collection of *National Geographic* magazines, and I enjoyed sitting in the little library area of her home and looking at all the photographs. I was very privileged that my life had been supplemented by a great appreciation of art and scholarship by both sides of my family, and I strongly feel that it is what has influenced me and my sister, a Collections Manager at the Ralph T. Coe Center in Santa Fe, New Mexico, to have a great appreciation for the arts today.

The background information that I presented is the reason for this unit. I grew up with such beautiful and culturally significant pieces and it gave me a rich appreciation for the arts and led me to seek avenues of literacy that paired with art, from oral literacy to being able to make connections of stories to paintings, to appreciating the prestige of a periodical that is well known for its award-winning photographs. I find that the ability to

NIZHÓNÍGO NA'ACH'AAH BAHANE'

appreciate words and stories lies in the arts, and I want to be able to show my students that stories and words can be enriched by art, and art can be enriched by words and stories. I want them to have the same appreciation for aesthetics and the hard work that goes into creating works of art. I want my kids to know that there are individuals who are of their people who have made an impact in the art world and have brought the lens of art appreciation to the Diné nation. I feel confident that I will light or fan a flame of curiosity and interest in at least one of my students to pursue the arts.

Content Objectives

A Brief History of Indigenous Education in the United States

When viewing to indigenous education through a historical lens, it becomes apparent that Indigenous people did not receive typical Western education. Through the Bureau of Indian Affairs, boarding schools in the United States were tasked with providing “education for American Indians with the ultimate goal of *civilizing* them according to the prevailing standards of European American culture” (BIA, n.d, in Charbonneau-Dahlen, Lowe, and Morris, 2016). To make indigenous people “civilized” meant to first, break up their family bonds and connection to the land through the Dawes Act of 1887 and then strip them of their culture and identity. This was done through Westernized schooling and forcible removal of Native children from their families (Charbonneau-Dahlen, et al., 2016, Lentis, 2016); withholding of rations if children weren't handed over to boarding school officials (Clarke Historical Library, 2008, para.7 in Charbonneau-Dahlen, et al, 2016); and, in some cases, being sent to Alcatraz Federal Penitentiary for not admitting their children to boarding school (National Park Service, 2007 in Charbonneau-Dahlen, et al., 2016).

Students at the boarding schools were subjected to, “deadly diseases, exhaustive manual labor, military marches (Stratham, 2015), as well as attempts of eradicating traditional cultures. According to Marlinda White-Kaulaity, a high school English teacher, “the history of Indian education indicates that instruction in the white man’s reading and writing came with damaging practices of indoctrination, assimilation, and colonization.” (White-Kaulaity, 2007). The historic effects of Indian boarding school education have left a lasting scar on the psyche of many elderly Diné people. I have seen the effects in my community that I observed that most people don't see school as a place where learning happens; rather, they see it as a place where obedience is instilled, and where routines are followed and obeyed.

Schools are supposed to be where students’ minds are opened up to develop interest in learning. Schools should be places where children can go to feel safe, accepted, appreciated, celebrated, and made to feel unique. All the positive feelings that should be present in schools, were beaten out of students in boarding schools of the past; but, with renewed culture in the classroom, there is hope of positive and enhanced learning and the harboring of a love for education within our children and we can move on from the harsh past that many of our ancestors have experienced in school and etch a new view of school for elders and people within our community.

A Brief History of Art in Indigenous Education

NIZHÓNÍGO NA'ACH'AAH BAHANE'

From the early part of the century, Indigenous American Indian art or art made from non-European societies, had been categorized as either scientific and/or cultural artifacts, or as aesthetically pleasing works (Bernstein, 1999, p. 57). Indigenous American Indian art was mostly seen as cultural artifact during the turn of the century and because of the efforts to “civilize the Indian” it was forbidden to create Indigenous Native American art because of its representation of cultures, traditions, languages, ways of life, and ceremonies that the United States desperately wanted to eradicate. Boarding schools in the mid-to late-1800s were the location of formal Western education, and it was at the boarding schools that art education was introduced as a means to supplement vocational work. Art instruction was viewed as valuable insofar as it might be useful to broader society and for its potential to contribute to the overall economic progress of the United States (Lentis, 2016).

The early twentieth century saw a transition from art instruction as vocational. Schools began to offer art classes as a means to cultivate in students an appreciation of traditional Western aesthetics. The introduction of traditional methods of art instruction was seen as a way to “civilize” Native American children, causing them to shed their old ways. In *Colonized through Art: American Indian Schools and Art Education 1889-1915*, Marinella Lentis explains, “Educators at the turn of the twentieth century argued that as Indian students became ‘civilized’ the development of their mental and manual skills through art classes would facilitate their assimilation into mainstream society” (p. 31).

Beginning in the 1930s, reformation of government boarding schools, along with the addition of community-based day schools and tribally run boarding schools, led to development of education for the purpose of learning rather than as a means to achieve forced assimilation. These changes allowed students to experience art in ways that promoted perpetuation and use of cultural imagery, and continuation of traditional life.

A Brief History of Contemporary Indigenous art in the 20th Century

Following the long resistance of Native communities against the United States’ expansion west under the notion that the “country” was destined to be colonized through divine command, the US gained control and appropriated land from Native people. Reservations were created to allow Native people to remain, whether or not the reservation was on ancestral lands or relocated somewhere else, following the agreement that children would attend government schools to be “civilized” and contribute to the booming American society.

Art skills were enlisted to vocational ends and art instruction was intended to produce Native people who might serve as cogs in the machine that would propel the United States’ capitalist visions. Along with the Western teachings of art that would later be introduced, art was a tool of assimilation, attempting to wipe out Native culture and replace it with Western culture (Lentis, 2016).

As told by Dr. Jennifer McLerran, in the late-nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, Native American art was driven by tourism and the need to supply tourists with Native American arts and crafts as souvenirs of their travels. The growth of tourism was due in large part to the expansion of the railroad and control of lands by the United States which led to a migration of

NIZHÓNÍGO NA'ACH'AAH BAHANE'

new occupants following expansion. Tourist demands for curio items that were quick to produce and low in cost shifted Native arts and crafts production from traditional utilitarian works of art to mass produced items that could provide a quick income.

The mass appropriation of lands and the shift from self-sufficiency and a subsistence lifestyle provided by the land to a capitalistic, wage-based living left a lot of Native people impoverished and struggling to make ends meet. Many Native people ceased the time consuming- production of traditional arts and crafts. Such activities required the time to acquire the necessary materials of production as well as the time to arrange and embellish the items. These were reasons for leaving behind the productions of higher-quality traditional crafts for the creation of modestly priced tourist items that could be sold to travelers visiting National parks and Fred Harvey train stations.

In the 1930s boarding schools, where so many terrible atrocities had occurred, saw a transformation from places of pain to places of education. In two Oklahoma colleges and an Indian school in Northern New Mexico, the fostering of white teachers with an appreciation of traditional Native American works and art would propel Native art and artists into the world and create a style that would come to constitute the distinctive “Traditional Native American art” of the 20th century. Oklahoma saw the rise of the Kiowa Five, who were influenced by historic Plains art forms, including ledger art. In New Mexico, Santa Fe Indian School art teacher Dorothy Dunn taught a style of Native art that would result in works by Pueblo, Navajo and Comanche artists characterized by rich line work, and color. The paintings and drawings that came out of the University of Oklahoma, the Santa Fe Indian School, and Oklahoma’s Bacone College did not utilize western art techniques, such as perspective and volumetric shading but opted for a flattened visual representation of day-to-day life in Pueblos, at ceremonies, and on the Plains or in other natural surroundings. Native American art would continue to be produced in this style for many years through the works of Andrew Tsinnajinnie, Harrison Begay, Quincy Tahoma, Oscar Howe, Ben Quintana, Geronimo Cruz Montoya, Allan Houser, Gerald Nailor, Hoke Denetsosie, Fred Kabotie, and Pablita Velarde (Benes, 2004).

These artists, who enjoyed wide popularity as fine artists, also illustrated books through Bureau of Indian Affairs sponsorship. These publications promoted Native American life and culture. They also included messages from federal government officials that proved unpopular among Native people, such as those conveyed by New Deal Commissioner of Indian Affairs John Collier who was a proponent of Native art and bilingual education but also instituted the livestock reduction that devastated the Navajo economy and subsistence lifestyle (Benes, 2004).

As time progressed Native artists began to shed the presumably traditional Native American art aesthetic that was taught by white art teachers like Dorothy Dunn and branch out and mix elements of Western art into their idea of traditional works and other avenues of self-expression. Today there are a number of Native American artists who have shown their Indigeneity through mixed media, performance art, installation pieces, spoken word, film, sculpture, photography, painting, and traditional arts and crafts. The pieces no longer only show life of the village or homestead but expose hardship, oppression, political anguish, body positivity, resistance, and resiliency.

NIZHÓNÍGO NA'ACH'AAH BAHANE'

Baje Whitethorne, Sr.

Baje Whitethorne, Sr. is a Diné artist from Peach Springs, which is near Shonto, Arizona on the Navajo Nation. He is Lók'aa' Dine'é, born for Háshk'aan Haadzooí, his maternal and paternal grandfathers were Tl'ízilání (Grier, 2019). He was born on August 9, 1950 and attended Tuba City school district and then Northern Arizona University (Adobe Gallery, 1998-2019). Baje Whitethorne Sr. has illustrated eight children's books, and authored two of them, *Sunpainters* and *Father's Boots*. Baje's illustrated books are *Beauty Beside Me*, *Little Black*, *Monster Birds*, *Monster Slayer*, *Sika and the Raven*, *The Moccasin Game*, *Sunpainters*, and *Father's Boots*. Whitethorne's paintings are displayed at the Twin Arrows Navajo Casino near Flagstaff, Arizona, and the rotunda of the Tséhootsooí Medical Center, also known as the Fort Defiance Indian Hospital in Fort Defiance, Arizona, features one of his murals. Baje Whitethorne, Sr. uses oil, acrylic, mixed media and watercolor in his work. Whitethorne is also a bronze sculptor (Eddie Basha Collection, 2019).

Shonto Begay

Shonto Begay is a Diné artist from the Kletha Valley near Shonto, Arizona on the Navajo Nation. He is Tódich'í'ni, born for Áshihí and was born on February 7, 1954 to a weaver and a medicine man. Shonto is the fifth child of 16 and received his Associate of Fine Arts degree from the Institute of American Indian Arts and a Bachelor of Fine Arts degree from the California College of Arts and Crafts (Sublette, M., 1996-2019). Shonto Begay has illustrated nine books, *Soldier Sister*, *Fly Home*; *Ma'ii and Cousin Horned Toad*; *The Magic of Spider Woman*; *Navajo Long Walk: The Tragic Story of a Proud People's Forced March from their Homeland*; *The Boy who Dreamed of an Acorn*; *Strawberry Pop and Soda Crackers*; *The Mud Pony (which won an Owl Award for Illustration)*, and *In My Desert*. He also wrote the text of two of the aforementioned books, and he illustrated a volume of his poems, *Navajo: Visions and Voices Across the Mesa* (Begay, 1995). Shonto Begay's art can be found in numerous galleries, with books available through online retailers, and murals on display at the Green Café on NAU campus, and at the Fort Sumner Historic Site/Bosque Redondo Memorial in Fort Sumner, New Mexico.

Teaching Strategies

The strategies that will be used will incorporate different differentiated techniques for as much participation from various types of learners that one may have in the classroom. There will be three differentiated activities and a pre-test with a post-test covering the topic of comparing and contrasting. Lessons will be delivered in whole class, and in small groups, while the assessments will be completed individually.

Analyzing the Text and Illustrations

For an analysis of the illustrations, the teacher will show the images from within a book to the students. The teacher will emphasize the content of the image, modeling how he or she notices all items in the image from one corner of the book to the opposite corner, and what may be inside buildings, under other items, on the clothing, on the ground or in the sky. Small details of items in

NIZHÓNÍGO NA'ACH'AAH BAHANE'

the illustration will be observed and made aware out loud while asking questions about the student's relationship or understanding of each object. The teacher will model his or her observation of the color choice for the illustration. He or she will think out loud to the students why the artist had chosen to use specific colors and ask the students why the artist chose the colors that are used. The teacher will also think out loud what kind of emotions that he or she feels when viewing the illustration, and what kind of memory the image brings up and relate the image and emotion to a time that he or she has experienced. The teacher will do this with every image that he or she shows to the students. After showing the illustrations the teacher will read the book to the students and make connections of the text to the illustrations, paying close attention to any words that exhibit emotion that can be associated with the color choice, line weight, or items in the illustration.

Each artist has a different style of painting and characteristic color schemes, and each has experience with authoring and illustrating his own books. Whitethorne, and Begay create their illustrations according to the message they're trying to deliver to the reader. Both artists grew up on the Diné Nation and have experiences very similar to the grandparents and parents of the students and to the experiences of some students within the classrooms of Ganado Primary School.

Whole Class Instruction

Whole class instruction means delivering lectures, lessons, and demonstrations to the entire class at one time. The analysis of the illustrations in the books will be done in the whole group instruction, along with reading of books. The same will go with the introduction of vocabulary and the Venn diagram graphic organizer.

Small Group Instruction

Read aloud, and review of tasks for comparing and contrasting should be done in small groups when the teacher observes that support is needed. The support may come in the form of another read aloud, reading of directions and questions, a step-by-step instruction of a Venn diagram, or a modeling and description of the details in the different types of art by Baje Whitethorne Sr. and Shonto Begay.

During group work the teacher will go around to each group, listening in to make sure students are on task and determining if anything is amiss. The teaching will come in and guide corrections or ask questions that lead the students to their answer or ask questions that will further their understanding and discussion of the topic.

Cubing

Cubing is a form of differentiated instruction that will give the student a choice in the work that they will be doing. Each assignment on each face of the cube should vary in degree of activity but should all lead to the same objective. This is to accommodate some students with different learning styles, or different levels of understanding. In this case, the cube will feature different media and either Begay or Whitethorne Sr. as the artist in relation to the task. Students will roll

NIZHÓNÍGO NA'ACH'AAH BAHANE'

the cube and the task that is face up will be their assignment; and, if the student chooses, he or she may roll again once more for a different task.

Classroom Activities

Compare and Contrast

Comparing and contrasting for the students in my class gets to be a chore in that the students aren't very aware of the vocabulary clues that would hint at a comparison or contrast of two different items. Students would stare blankly and answer whatever guess they have without referring back to the text or being able to show where in the text they found the answer. The following activities will cover the *Reading Literature* standard that focuses on comparing and contrasting two different versions of the same story. Although we are not using two different versions of the same story, we are using knowledge of vocabulary context clues and an understanding of the use of a Venn diagram and showing how to use text evidence when it is necessary.

Primary materials will be pencils, erasers, markers, highlighters or crayons for the students, white copy paper to print out the biographies, and fact sheets in regard to the artists and arts. A large roll of butcher paper will be needed; however, I would suggest calling up the *Navajo Times* to ask for one of their end rolls. An end roll is the last bit of left-over newsprint that is typically discarded because it is not large enough to print. The *Navajo Times* saves the end rolls and will give them to teachers to use in the classroom. A pair of scissors, some tape or glue, to stick sentences onto the paper, some washable and permanent markers, a timer, and a way to randomly draw names of students as partners if you choose to do so are also needed. I use popsicle or "craft" sticks with each student's name and place them in a can, which can be an upcycled empty coffee can or spaghetti sauce jar.

Compare and Contrast Vocabulary

The teacher will list words that cue the use of comparing and contrasting. The list can be presented on the white board or SMART board for students to copy onto flash cards and in their notebooks. The teacher will review each word with the students, asking them to read the words four times. The teacher will also use flash cards in small groups, and during any review so students will be able to recognize the word and how to read it. The teacher should emphasize the sounds that each letter in the word makes paying close attention to blends, special vowel pairs, and digraphs.

Compare Words	Contrast words
Like	Although
Similar to	Yet
Same	However
Alike	But
Such as	While
Too	Differ
Both	Instead

Have in common	Unlike On the other-hand
----------------	-----------------------------

Compare and Contrast Indian Art Education and Western Art Education

A brief summary will be written about the histories of both Native American and Western art, artists. Compare and contrast context clue words will be used to indicate a similarity or difference, prompting the use of comparing or contrasting. The comparing and contrasting will be done on a worksheet created for the students. Each of the students will complete their work and check it by highlighting where in the text they found their answers. Students must read their answers and the text evidence. In some cases, the student will say that the answer matches the text evidence when it obviously doesn't. In this case, the student may not be able to read on their own, or has a lot of challenges with reading comprehension and should be paired with a student who can read the text for them, or they should join a small group with an instructional assistant, or teacher that can read the text and questions for them. The vocabulary words should be posted during this activity and students should be allowed to use their notebooks with the vocabulary terms written in them.

Snowball Fight- Books

The teacher will prepare or choose several students to prepare five 2-foot-long sheets of butcher paper. The teacher or student will label the papers at the top with *The Legend of Spider Woman* at the top of one sheet, *Monster Birds* at the top of the second sheet, BOTH at the top of the third, and on the last two the words, "Compare and Contrast Vocabulary" will be written. The teacher or the students will write the compare and contrast vocabulary in a T-chart on the two pieces of butcher paper as a reminder for students. The teacher will then post the papers around the room in a student- accessible area clear of anything over which the students may trip and high enough so they can tape things onto the sheet.

The teacher will then read the two chosen books, *The Legend of Spider Woman* and *Monster Birds*, to the students. The two books should be read all week during guided read time, along with the analysis of the artistry for each book as mentioned in the Analysis of Text and Illustrations portion of Teaching Strategies.

The teacher will prepare sentences, details from events, or illustrations from each book and write or type them out on a sheet of paper. Each paper should be written with the idea of a student reading the paper and relating what's on the paper to either *Monster Birds*, *The Legend of Spider Woman*, or both stories. The teacher should type out as many sentences, details, or observations as he or she can think of keeping in mind that there should be at least one paper per students and with the objective of students understanding when to compare and contrast. This activity can be modified to fit your students' level of understanding of comparing and contrasting. It can be one sentence (for example: "It has a character named, Monster Slayer"), or it can incorporate a context clue word for comparing and contrasting for which the student writes out the contrast of both stories on either side (for example: *The colors in this book are brighter, unlike the darker colors used in this book.* Or *"Both of these stories follow traditional Navajo legends; however, this story has a male protagonist).* The language use and sentence structure or challenge that will

NIZHÓNÍGO NA'ACH'AAH BAHANE'

fit your students understanding is what you should use and what you the teacher know of your class's comprehension level.

Once the papers are all written out you will hand them to the students, and you will all read them out loud so everyone can hear what is written. Students will then be instructed to crumple up their papers and place them on the table. The teacher will inform the students that they will have a "snowball fight" but must follow her guidelines of safety precautions. The students will throw the "snowballs" for one minute, and then pick up or have one "snowball" each. The students will open up the "snowball" and will go about taping the sentence to its corresponding place on the butcher paper or write it there if you want them to write instead. Students should be reminded that a list of compare and contrast vocabulary words are also posted. This activity can be done solely with vocabulary words as well.

Intro to the Venn diagram

The teacher should present to the class the graphic organizer called the Venn diagram. Either drawn on a white board, presented in an overhead, or displayed on a Promethean or SMART board, the teacher should be able to let the students know what it's called and what it's used for. In this activity the teacher will show an example of a pre-drawn Venn Diagram on a 2-foot-long sheet of butcher paper. Each student will be given a sheet of paper, and it will be up to the teacher's discretion to group the students, pair them, or direct them to create individually; but for me, in my class, I would pair up the students.

Once the students are paired up and they have a sheet of butcher paper, they will copy the Venn diagram onto their own sheet. For the students who are quick and do things very fast and are already asking what they should do next while the rest of the class is barely writing out the first word they see, you will advise one of them to be the writer and the other to be the teller. The writer will not be facing the diagram, but the teller will be. The writer will use their non-dominant hand and will only draw or write according to their memory or to what the teller tells them. The teller can look at the paper but cannot show how to create the diagram using any hand movements or gestures. Everything must be told. The teacher should be close by to listen for any areas of speech that can be corrected and suggest vocabulary or directions that the teller may not be able to communicate. If there is frustration, the teller and writer can switch places only after the writer has been given a fair amount of time to try. Students will be advised to also draw a copy of the Venn diagram in their English Language Arts (ELA) notebook if they have one. They will then compare what they have drawn and written to the teacher's diagram to check for errors in spelling and so forth. They will use a highlighter to tap under each letter to make sure there is a match for each letter in their copy, basically checking if their spelling matches that of the teacher's. I would predict that this tedious checking would instill in them the need to GO BACK TO THE TEXT, and make sure that what they're doing is what is seen on the screen or presented to them. The same goes for showing the text evidence in the previous activities.

Venn diagram- Authors- Paired work

The teacher will pair students up randomly, or by choice of the teacher. I use popsicle sticks with the names of each child written on the stick and shake them up in a can and pull out a stick to

NIZHÓNÍGO NA'ACH'AAH BAHANE'

choose by random. If I know that the pair is going to be unproductive, then I will put one name back in and pull again without announcing whose name it was, but more often than not, I am surprised by the honest work produced by a bouncy pair of kids. After students are paired, the teacher will then give the students reading passages that provide short biographies about Shonto Begay and Baje Whitethorne, Sr. The teacher will inform the students that they will be reading the two biographical texts about the artists and they will draw a first draft Venn diagram on an 8X10 paper with the diagram already printed on it, and after they've reviewed their work and shown the evidence (highlighting or underlining where they chose the answer from in the text), then they can make a large Venn diagram with what they found on a 2-foot-sheet of butcher paper. Students that need extra help or have an IEP should have the biographies read to them and should orally tell an Instructional Assistant, the teacher, or a student whom he or she is paired with who is able to write legibly with fair spelling skills. The student who needs support will write what's in the 8x10 Venn diagram onto the large butcher paper Venn diagram. It should be made clear that the students who need support do have a job in the group and it is their job to provide the listening and oral contribution.

Compare and contrast two paintings

Students will be given individual blank sheets of paper and they will be instructed to create a Venn diagram to compare and contrast two items. After students have created their Venn diagrams, they will be given two different paintings, one by Baje Whitethorne, Sr. and one by Shonto Begay. Students will observe the paintings and identify details of similarity and difference to add to their Venn diagram. For students who are on target in identifying color, line, representation and artist, the teacher will compare and contrast a Whitethorne piece, and a Begay artwork against a Henri Matisse and a Vincent Van Gogh painting. I suggest using Matisse's *Open Window*, and Vincent van Gogh's *Starry Night* and print in color or, if possible, a poster of each purchased from an online store. Students will compare and contrast the art work. The teacher will label the paintings with the names and the titles of the pieces as well as the media and year they were created.

Cubing of Student Art

Students will do one assignment according to what is written on the face of the cube they roll on. They will be given a paper cube with tasks already printed out on it and they will roll the cube. The task facing them on the top of the cube is their assignment. The students are given two rolls and will decide which one they will do. I would advise numbering the cube faces or coloring the face, so it is easier to remember what the other task was when the student is deciding which to do. The student will complete the task and turn in their work. Students should perform a rough and first draft before painting. If you notice that you have a student who may surpass your expectations of the assignment or you see that your class may need a challenge, then the activities on each face can be altered to what you feel may challenge them. Perhaps, instead of instructing them to paint on their own, you can have your student recreate an illustrated scene from a book or from their gallery showing art by either painter using a different medium such as crayon, watercolor, acrylic, colored pencil, oil pastel, photograph, clay or mosaic (torn up construction paper glued together to make an image).

Student Assessment Plan

Learning Goal	Assessment	Assessment Format
Students will be able to identify vocabulary terms	Formative	Use of terms throughout the week's activities.
Students will read two literary passages and will respond to questions in regard to comparing and contrasting details.	Pre-Assessment Post-Assessment Formative	ATI Galileo quiz, or teacher made assessment.
Students will be able to accurately use a Venn diagram to compare and contrast.	Formative	Culminating cubing assignment outcome
Students will be able to mimic the work of a Diné artist and identify the name of the artist.	Formative Assessment Culminating Activity	Students will perform the same cubing assignment before being introduced to Baje Whitethorne, Sr. and Shonto Begay.
Students will be able to describe and display their art based on their emotion and memory through color, line, and representations.	Formative Culminating Activity	Students will perform the same cubing assignment before being introduced to Baje Whitethorne, Sr. and Shonto Begay.

Alignment with Standards

The standards that the unit will cover will be one English Language Arts standard from the Arizona College Readiness Common Core State Standards and the Department of Diné Education Diné Content Standard. The focus of one standard is to make sure that the students are able to get as many activities as possible that transfer the objective of being able to identify words that indicate a comparison and contrast of two stories, as well as being able to identify the differences and similarities and show evidence of the two. The standard focuses on comparing and contrasting two stories, fables, or folktales from two different cultures; but, in this unit, students will be tasked with comparing and contrasting different illustrations and texts in hopes that the information that is delivered will translate to comparing and contrasting the stories that are assessed in the district assessment for the standard.

The Diné content standard in mind will be a character-building standard. The character-building standards established through the Department of Diné Education (DODE) have the objective to develop and apply critical thinking to establish relationships with the environment with an emphasis of being aware of self.

NIZHÓNÍGO NA'ACH'AAH BAHANE'

2.RL. 9- Compare and contrast two or more versions of the same story (e.g. Cinderella stories) by different authors or from different cultures.

Standard: K'é dóó nitsáhákees dóó nahat'á náásgóó iiná bee siih hasingo ádoolnííł. Concept 1- Nitsáhákees: Shintsáhákees shil niliigo bee ádaa'ákonisdzin dooleel. PO 2: Yódí altaas'éí choosh'ínígíí baa haah nisin dooleel. (*Standard: I will develop an understanding of Dine way of life. Concept 1- I will acknowledge and value my thoughts and personality. PO 2: I will describe the value of things that I use.*)

Resources

Adobe Gallery. (1998-2018). *Baje Whitethorne, Sr.* Retrieved from

<https://www.adobegallery.com/artist/baje-whitethrone-sr-1950-giggling-boy>

A gallery site where Whitethorne's work is sold which contains bits of informational biography of Whitethorne.

Begay, S. (1995). *Navajo: Visions and Voices Across the Mesa*. New York: Scholastic.

A book written by Begay that contains his beautiful illustrations along with poems and short stories of the Diné Nation.

Begay, S. (1992). *Ma'ii and Cousin Horned Toad: A Traditional Navajo Story*. New York: Scholastic Inc.,

A book written by Begay that contains his illustrations which can be used in the assignments along with a story that can only be told in the winter.

Benes, R.C. (2004). *Native American Picture Books of Change: The Art of Historic Children's Editions*. Santa Fe, NM: Museum of New Mexico Press.

A wonderful resource for teachers who may want to look up books of Native life and traditional Native American art.

Bernstein, B. (1999). Contexts for the Growth and Development of the Indian Art World in the 1960s and 1970s. Rushing, W.J. (Ed.), *Native American Art in the Twentieth Century* (pp. 57-71). New York, NY: Routledge.

A good resource for teachers who may want to expand their understanding of Native American art.

Browne, V., & Whitethorne, B. (1991). *Monster Slayer: A Navajo Folktale* (1st ed.). Flagstaff, Ariz.: Northland Pub.

A rich and colorful story about the hero twins in Diné stories. The illustrations are bright and relate to the children in the elementary setting. The images can be analyzed and used for comparing and contrasting

Browne, V., & Whitethorne, B. (1993). *Monster Birds: A Navajo Folktale* (1st ed.). Flagstaff, Ariz.: Northland Pub.

NIZHÓNÍGO NA'ACH'AAH BAHANE'

The same type of illustrations and characters as in *Monster Slayer*, but this time the boys go after the birds at Shiprock. It's a good use of place on the reservation and can be supplementary material to any classroom.

Bruchac, J., & Begay, S. (2002). *Navajo Long Walk: The Tragic Story of a Proud People's Forced March from Their Homeland*. Washington, D.C.: National Geographic Society. A hard tale to tell, but necessary for cultural growth and resiliency. The colors used are dark, which can be analyzed and discussed with the students. Similar to Picasso's Blue Period, which evoked feelings of despair and sadness. A rough time in history that is complemented by visual aids that can be used in the classroom.

Charbonneau-Dahlen, B. K., Lowe, J., & Morris, S. L. (2016). Giving Voice to Historical Trauma Through Storytelling: The Impact of Boarding School Experience on American Indians. *Journal of Aggression, Maltreatment & Trauma*, (6), 598. Retrieved from <https://search-ebscohost-com.libproxy.unm.edu/login.aspx?direct=true&db=edsbl&AN=vdc.100034071709.0x000001&site=eds-live&scope=site>

An article that a non-Native teacher, and Native teacher can use to better understand the tragedy and oppression that traumatized a generation of Native people and continues today.

Cohen, C. L., & Begay, S. (1988). *The Mud Pony: A Traditional Skidi Pawnee Tale*. New York: Scholastic

An easily accessible book with many online worksheets available. The earthy tones used in the illustrations provide a nice contrast to Whitethorne's color palette, which is characterized by bright, blasting pastels.

Duncan, L., & Begay, S. (1996). *The Magic of Spider Woman*. New York: Scholastic
A tale that should be told in the winter evokes strong imagery of a woman leader.

Eddie Basha Collection. (2019). *Baje Whitethorne*. Retrieved from <http://eddiebashacollection.com/collection/baje-whitethorne>.

Farley, W., Whitethorne, B., & Carr, E. (2006). *Little Black, A Pony: Líshzhiin Yázhí*. Flagstaff, AZ: Salina Bookshelf.

A retelling of a traditional story with beautiful illustrations that are easily relatable to any Diné child. The content on each page is easy to read, especially for students who are not yet text literate.

Grier, T. (2019, Aug. 11). *Baje Whitethorne Sr. - Navajo Artist - Living History*. Retrieved from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VBmZ3W_0t8I.

A gallery site that has biographical information about Baje Whitethorne Sr. along with his work that is for sale and information about his prices.

Hammerschlag, C. A., & Whitethorne, B. (1999). *Sika and the Raven: Based on Native American Legend*. Phoenix, AZ: Turtle Island Press.

NIZHÓNÍGO NA'ACH'AAH BAHANE'

Lentis, M. (2017). "An Indispensable Adjunct to All Training of This Kind": The Place of Art in Indian Schools. *Colonized through Art: American Indian Schools and Art Education, 1889-1915* (pp. 31-69). Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press.

A good resource for non-Natives and Native American teachers who want to learn more about art in Indian schools.

Navajo Division of Health. (December 2013). *Navajo Population Profile 2010 U.S. Census*. <http://www.nec.navajo-nsn.gov/Portals/0/Reports/NN2010PopulationProfile.pdf>

White-Kaulaity, M. (2007). Reflections on Native American Reading: A Seed, a Tool, and a Weapon. *Journal of Adolescent & Adult Literacy*, 50(7), 560. <https://doi-org.libproxy.unm.edu/10.1598/JAAL.50.7.5>

A great article that can help non-Native people, as well as Native American teachers, remember that wisdom isn't always measured in ability to read text. Our elders were and are intelligent people, and literacy isn't something we always had.

Whitethorne, B., Redhair, D., Yellowhair, M., & Johnson, J. T. (2001). *Father's Boots: Azhé'é bikénidoots'osii*. Flagstaff, AZ: Salina Bookshelf.

A supplement to a classroom that gives illustration and tales of Diné life from the viewpoint of artist Baje Whitethorne, Sr.

Yazzie, S. G., & Whitethorne, B. (2011). *Beauty Beside Me: Stories of My Grandmother's Skirts: Shimá sání bitl'aakal noot'ishígíí: nizhónígo nidaashch'aa'go baa hane'*. Flagstaff, AZ: Salina Bookshelf.

Beautiful illustrations that can be analyzed and used as example of art for students to follow. The inspiration for the text and the art is a child's memory of being with their grandmother and being the height of her skirt. Teachers can prompt students to use their memories to come up with things that they were fond of or have experienced much like the colors of their grandmother's skirts.

Zolbrod, P. (1984). *Dine Bahane': The Navajo Creation Story*. Albuquerque, New Mexico. University of New Mexico Press.

A good resource and easy read for any person wanting to have better insight into the traditional stories of Diné. However, it is advisable that a non-Native person make contact with Diné friends or faculty to help guide what can be told at what time, and better explanation of things that are fully understood.

Appendix

Cubing of student art

	<p>Illustrate a picture of your house using watercolor in the style of Baje Whitethorne, Sr. On a separate card, put your name, date, title of your art, and the medium.</p>	
<p>Illustrate a picture of your favorite animal using watercolor in the style of Baje Whitethorne, Sr. On a separate card, put your name, date, title of your art, and the medium.</p>	<p>Illustrate a picture of a family member using watercolor in the style of Baje Whitethorne, Sr. On a separate card, put your name, date, title of your art, and the medium.</p>	<p>Illustrate a picture of your favorite animal using acrylic paint in the style of Shonto Begay. On a separate card, put your name, date, title of your art, and the medium.</p>
	<p>Illustrate a picture of your house using acrylic paint in the style of Shonto Begay. On a separate card, put your name, date, title of your art, and the medium.</p>	

NIZHÓNÍGO NA'ACH'AAH BAHANE'

<p>Illustrate a picture of a family member using acrylic paint in the style of Shonto Begay. On a separate card, put your name, date, title of your art, and the medium.</p>
--